Title of Report: Canine Control Officer Services RFP Recommendation

Department: Administration

Council Date: July 8, 2015

Council Recommendation:
Be it resolved that Council receive staff report CAO 2015-047 as information; and
That Council approve awarding the Southgate Canine Control Officer contract to Karyn Foster.

Background:
The Township of Southgate Council directed staff at the May 20, 2015 meeting to release a Canine Control Officer RFP document for closing on June 10, 2015 at 2:00 pm.

Staff Comments:
Southgate staff opened the Canine Control Officer (CCO) Services Request for Proposal’s received on June 10, 2015, just after 2:00 pm. Staff involved with the Canine Control Officer Services RFP opening were Treasurer Brenda Schenk, By-law Enforcement Officer Doug Kopp, and CAO Dave Milliner. This bid opening was also completed at the same time as Public Works opening for winter sand and culverts.

Following the June 10, 2015 CCO Services bid opening, By-law Enforcement Officer Doug Kopp and CAO Dave Milliner visited with each of the bidders at their locations to inspect the kennel facilities and the vehicle used to pick up the stray dogs. One bidder has ordered a new vehicle, so we were not able to complete that inspection.

Two site visits were completed on June 12, 2015 and the third site was inspected on June 16, 2015. As a result of those site inspections the By-law Enforcement Officer and the CAO each reviewed the proposals separately to score the three proposals based on the submissions and the site visits. The scoring used to evaluate the proposals was based on the attached document to this report, Attachment #1 titled “Canine Control Officer Service RFP Scoring Chart”. This information was also clearly spelled out in the RFP document on page 7 under the section titled “Proposal Evaluation Criteria” as follows:
**Proposal Evaluation Criteria:**
The following criteria will be used for evaluation and scoring of each proposal.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation Criteria</th>
<th>Evaluation Weighting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. CCO Experience</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Customer Service</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Kennel Facilities</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. References &amp; Training</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Bid Price compared to Service Delivery</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. “CCO Experience” will be evaluated based on years of experience as a Canine Control Officer.

2. “Customer Service” will be scored based on related experience in dealing with the public, customer service delivery, dealing with challenging issues in a tactful manner, enforcement role, and municipal experience.

3. “Kennel Facilities” will be scored based on site inspections, to occur on June 11, 2015, if required.

4. “References and Training” will be scored on references, training related to skills necessary/beneficial to the CCO responsibilities and other related information we receive or derive during the selection process and interviews, if required.

5. “Bid Price compared to Service Delivery” will be scored based on the bid price, kennel fees and indirect costs related to ratepayer convenience and access to the Canine service.

Proponent proposals should make comments in each of these areas and provide documentation and/or references to confirm the information where possible.

Reference checks were then completed by Debbie Mills on June 18th and 19th, 2015, using the attached form to this staff report, Attachment #2 titled “Canine Control Officer Reference Checks”.

On June 20, 2015, Debbie Mills met with By-law Enforcement Officer Doug Kopp and CAO Dave Milliner to provide the reports and feedback received from the reference checks.

The By-law Enforcement Officer and the CAO then finalized their individual review and assessment of each of the proposals based on CCO Services RFP scoring criteria.
The scoring results are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>By-law Enforcement Officer</th>
<th>CAO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R &amp; R Pet Paradise</td>
<td>66.0</td>
<td>69.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lindsayleigh Pet Resort</td>
<td>77.5</td>
<td>72.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karyn Foster</td>
<td>95.5</td>
<td>90.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The main factors that gave the proposal from Karyn Foster a higher score and justification for staff’s recommendation, is the combination of the following:

- Previous experience being 12 years as a Canine Control Officer in the Township;
- 20 years as Veterinarian Technician in the care of the animals;
- The Foster’s kennel is located in the Township for convenience for Southgate residents like one other proposal;
- The lower kennel fee charge per day quoted in this bid and one other proposal;
- Ms. Foster’s previous track record in finding new homes for unclaimed dogs, to minimize Township kennel costs;
- Ms. Foster’s previous track record and experience in the care of the animals she receives that minimizes the need for veterinarian services and associated costs to the Township; and
- The positive references received with this proposal with some being related to specific experiences in the business of Canine Control Officer duties and site kennel inspection work.

Financial Impact or Long Term Implications
The financial impact, as a result of this staff report and the RFP results were evaluated against the 2015 budget for canine control. The 2015 budget for Canine total revenue is $35,500.00 and the total expenses targeted to be $29,560.00. The 2015 budget expense line specifically for the Canine Control Officer Contract is $27,310.00.

As a result, the projected cost of the present Canine Control Officer to the end of July, 2015, and this recommendation for the CCO Services RFP award starting August 1, 2015 is $26,913.81 for the 2015 budget year.

Communications & Community Action Plan Impact:
This report has been written and presented to Council to communicate accurate information to the public. Southgate Goal #1-A – Trusted, Timely, Transparent, Decision Making.
Concluding Comments

1. That Council receive this report as information.
2. That Council approved awarding the Canine Control Officer Services RFP to Karyn Foster.

Respectfully Submitted,

CAO approval: ____________________________

Dave Milliner – CAO
dmilliner@southgate.ca  519-923-2110 x223

Attachment #1 - Canine Control Officer Service RFP Scoring Chart
Attachment #2 – Canine Control Officer Reference Checks
## Canine Control Officer Service RFP Scoring Chart

**Bidder:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposal Evaluation Criteria</th>
<th>Sub-Criteria</th>
<th>Scoring Rationale</th>
<th>Assigned Service Points</th>
<th>Points Awarded</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>CCO Experience</strong> 20%</td>
<td>Years of service as a Canine Control Officer</td>
<td>Award 2 points for every year of Canine Control Officer experience.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Customer Service</strong> 20%</td>
<td>Years of experience in any role related to Customer Service delivery</td>
<td>Award 2 points for every year of Customer Service experience to a maximum 20 pts.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kennel Facilities</strong> 20%</td>
<td>Facility inspection</td>
<td>Maximum 8 points</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vehicle inspection</td>
<td>Maximum 2 points</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Years of Service as a Kennel Operator and/or Owner</td>
<td>2 points/year as a Kennel Operator or Owner</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>References &amp; Training</strong> 20%</td>
<td>&gt; Quality of References (4 pts/reference)</td>
<td>&gt; CCO Reference &gt; Kennel Reference &gt; General Reference (maximum of 12 points)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt; Training related to CCO duties</td>
<td>&gt; 1 point per training courses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt; Training related to Kennel operations</td>
<td>&gt; 1 point per applicable course</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt; Education other applicable training like first aid/CPR, safety training, etc</td>
<td>&gt; 1 point per applicable course (maximum of 8 points)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bid Price compared to Service Delivery</strong> 20%</td>
<td>&gt; Bid Pricing (15 points in total)</td>
<td>&gt; 15 points for low bid with a one point subtraction for every $1,000 above the lowest price.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt; Kennel Fees (3 points in total)</td>
<td>&gt; 3 points for low price &amp; a 1 point penalty/$2 over low bid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt; Kennel location—Ratepayer convenience for kennel location</td>
<td>&gt; 1 point</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt; Response time &amp; distance to furthest location</td>
<td>&gt; 1 point</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Bidders Total Points**
Canine Control Officer Reference Checks

Reference for: ____________________________________________

Name of the Reference: ______________________________________

Type of Reference: Business or Personal

1. What is your relationship with this person or company?
   Dog Owner    Customer    Business    Supplier    Friend

2. What are 3 words that would best describe this person or company?
   _________________________________________________________

3. How would you rank them related to customer service and people skills?
   Ranking  5  4  3  2  1  0  (5 being the best)

4. How would you rank them related to dealing with and handling dogs?
   Ranking  5  4  3  2  1  0  (5 being the best)

5. How would you rank them on response time for service?
   Ranking  5  4  3  2  1  0  (5 being the best)

6. How would you rank them on your business needs or satisfying concerns?
   Ranking  5  4  3  2  1  0  (5 being the best)

7. How would you rank their kennel facility?
   Ranking  5  4  3  2  1  0  (5 being the best)

8. How would you rank their Canine Control Officer service they provided?
   Ranking  5  4  3  2  1  0  (5 being the best)

Score out of _____/30  (Points Awarded - >24=4, 18-23=3, 12-17=2, 6-11=1 & <6=0)

Reference Checked by: __________________________ Date: ________________